Parking choices

Michel Bierlaire

June 28, 2018

Context

This case study aims at analyzing car driver's behaviour when choosing a parking place. The objective was to assess the economic viability of an underground car park that the municipality of Santoña (Spain) was planning to construct in order to solve the lack of available parking.

Santoña is a a small coastal town of about 10,000 inhabitants in Cantabria, Spain (in 2007). The economy of the town revolves around food preserves and tourism, the latter being especially important during the summer when the population grows considerably. The Regional Government of Cantabria, the local council and the private sector, put forward a project for constructing an underground car park to solve the lack of available parking in the study area. The local authorities asked the University of Cantabria to prepare an economic viability plan for the proposal.

The GIST (Grupo de Investigacion de Sistemas de Transportes, University of Cantabria, Spain) conducted a stated-preferences survey that consisted of eight choice scenarios based on the following alternatives:

- Free on-street parking (FSP),
- Paid on-street parking (PSP), and
- Paid parking in an underground car park (PUP).

Additional explanations on the performance of the survey and the consequent study can be found in Ibeas et al. (2014).

Data Collection

The sample size of roughly 200 respondents was selected after the design of the definitive version of the survey became available. Respondents were contacted on the streets of the study area, either when they were in the process of parking, or about to start a car journey. Due to the difficulty of recruiting a random sample in wide and open areas, the sampling method was specified as follows: each interviewer was assigned a certain zone and was instructed to approach every driver encountered. Although not all drivers accepted to participate in the survey, a very high (90%) response rate was obtained.

The method was designed to be random among the individuals who parked in the study area and, although it is always essential to account for the difficulty of isolating the subpopulation affected in any given study, in this case it is certain that all individuals interviewed would have experienced the policy if it had been already implemented, thereby ensuring the realism of the choice experiment.

Variables and Descriptive Statistics

The experimental design finally considered the following three variables:

- access time to parking (AT), i.e., the time a user takes once arriving to the parking area, to find an empty space and park,
- access time to destination (TD), i.e., the time a user takes from the parking space to his/her real destination, and
- parking fee (FEE), i.e., the amount paid for parking, either in the street or in the underground car park.

The defined scenarios are the following:

	FSP			PSP			PUP		
Scenario	AT	TD	FEE	AT	TD	FEE	AT	TD	FEE
1	10	10	0	10	10	0.6	5	10	0.8
2	10	15	0	10	15	0.6	5	10	0.8
3	15	15	0	10	10	0.8	5	10	0.8
4	15	10	0	10	15	0.8	5	10	0.8
5	15	15	0	10	10	0.6	5	10	1.5
6	15	10	0	10	15	0.6	5	10	1.5
7	10	10	0	10	10	0.8	5	10	1.5
8	10	15	0	10	15	0.8	5	10	1.5

Table 1: SP scenarios based on the AT, TD and FEE variables

Thus, there are 8 responses per individual, each of them associated with a different choice scenario. The number of observations is 1576.

The variables of the dataset are described in Table 2, and the descriptive statistics are summarized in Table 3.

OBSIDUnique numerical identifier for each observationIDUnique numerical identifier for each respondentSCENARIOId of the scenarioCHOICEId of the chosen alternativeGENDER1 if the respondent is female, 0 otherwiseA201 if the age of the respondent ≤ 20 ; 0 otherwiseA21301 if the age of the respondent is $\in [20, 31]$; 0 otherwiseA31401 if the age of the respondent is $\in [31, 40]$; 0 otherwiseA41501 if the age of the respondent is $\in [51, 60]$; 0 otherwiseA51601 if the age of the respondent ≥ 61 ; 0 otherwiseRESIDENT1 if the age of the respondent ≥ 61 ; 0 otherwiseOINT1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseOINT1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseODINT1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwiseAVEH31 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwiseAVEH21 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwiseINCMIncome level (monthly, in euros)INCHIncome level (hourly, in euros)AT1Access time to the parking space of alternative 1 (FSP)					
SCENARIOId of the scenarioCHOICEId of the chosen alternativeGENDER1 if the respondent is female, 0 otherwiseA201 if the age of the respondent ≤ 20 ; 0 otherwiseA21301 if the age of the respondent is $\in [20, 31]$; 0 otherwiseA31401 if the age of the respondent is $\in [31, 40]$; 0 otherwiseA41501 if the age of the respondent is $\in [41, 50]$; 0 otherwiseA51601 if the age of the respondent ≥ 61 ; 0 otherwiseRESIDENT1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwiseOINT1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseDINT1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseODINT1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwiseAVEH31 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwiseAVEH21 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwiseINCMIncome level (monthly, in euros)INCHIncome level (hourly, in euros)					
$ \begin{array}{c} \hbox{CHOICE} \\ \hbox{GENDER} \\ \hbox{A20} \\ \hbox{1 if the respondent is female, 0 otherwise} \\ \hbox{A2130} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the respondent } \leq 20; 0 \hbox{ otherwise} \\ \hbox{A2130} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the respondent is } \in [20,31]; 0 \hbox{ otherwise} \\ \hbox{A3140} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the respondent is } \in [31,40]; 0 \hbox{ otherwise} \\ \hbox{A4150} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the respondent is } \in [41,50]; 0 \hbox{ otherwise} \\ \hbox{A5160} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the respondent is } \in [51,60]; 0 \hbox{ otherwise} \\ \hbox{A61} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the respondent } \geq 61; 0 \hbox{ otherwise} \\ \hbox{RESIDENT} \\ \hbox{1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwise} \\ \hbox{OINT} \\ \hbox{1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise} \\ \hbox{OINT} \\ \hbox{1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise} \\ \hbox{ODINT} \\ \hbox{1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwise} \\ \hbox{AVEH3} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise} \\ \hbox{AVEH2} \\ \hbox{1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise} \\ \hbox{INCM} \\ \hbox{Income level (monthly, in euros)} \\ \hbox{INCH} \\ \hbox{Income level (hourly, in euros)} \\ \end{array}$					
GENDER 1 if the respondent is female, 0 otherwise A20 1 if the age of the respondent ≤ 20; 0 otherwise A2130 1 if the age of the respondent is ∈ [20,31]; 0 otherwise A3140 1 if the age of the respondent is ∈ [31,40]; 0 otherwise A4150 1 if the age of the respondent is ∈ [41,50]; 0 otherwise A5160 1 if the age of the respondent is ∈ [51,60]; 0 otherwise A61 1 if the age of the respondent ≥ 61; 0 otherwise RESIDENT 1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwise OINT 1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise DINT 1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise ODINT 1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwise AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$					
A21301 if the age of the respondent is $\in [20, 31]$; 0 otherwiseA31401 if the age of the respondent is $\in [31, 40]$; 0 otherwiseA41501 if the age of the respondent is $\in [41, 50]$; 0 otherwiseA51601 if the age of the respondent is $\in [51, 60]$; 0 otherwiseA611 if the age of the respondent ≥ 61 ; 0 otherwiseRESIDENT1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwiseOINT1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseDINT1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseODINT1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwiseAVEH31 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwiseAVEH21 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwiseINCMIncome level (monthly, in euros)INCHIncome level (hourly, in euros)					
A31401 if the age of the respondent is $\in [31, 40]$; 0 otherwiseA41501 if the age of the respondent is $\in [41, 50]$; 0 otherwiseA51601 if the age of the respondent is $\in [51, 60]$; 0 otherwiseA611 if the age of the respondent ≥ 61 ; 0 otherwiseRESIDENT1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwiseOINT1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseDINT1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseODINT1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwiseAVEH31 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwiseAVEH21 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwiseINCMIncome level (monthly, in euros)INCHIncome level (hourly, in euros)					
A41501 if the age of the respondent is \in [41, 50]; 0 otherwiseA51601 if the age of the respondent is \in [51, 60]; 0 otherwiseA611 if the age of the respondent \geq 61; 0 otherwiseRESIDENT1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwiseOINT1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseDINT1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseODINT1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwiseAVEH31 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwiseAVEH21 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwiseINCMIncome level (monthly, in euros)INCHIncome level (hourly, in euros)					
A51601 if the age of the respondent is \in [51,60]; 0 otherwiseA611 if the age of the respondent \geq 61; 0 otherwiseRESIDENT1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwiseOINT1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseDINT1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwiseODINT1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwiseAVEH31 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwiseAVEH21 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwiseINCMIncome level (monthly, in euros)INCHIncome level (hourly, in euros)					
A61 1 if the age of the respondent ≥ 61; 0 otherwise RESIDENT 1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwise OINT 1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise DINT 1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise ODINT 1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwise AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
RESIDENT 1 if the respondent is resident in the town; 0 otherwise OINT 1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise DINT 1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise ODINT 1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwise AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
OINT 1 if the origin of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise DINT 1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise ODINT 1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwise AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
DINT 1 if the destination of the trip is in the town; 0 otherwise ODINT 1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwise AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
ODINT 1 if the origin and the destination of the trip are in the totherwise AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
otherwise AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
AVEH3 1 if the age of the vehicle is 3 years or less; 0 otherwise AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)	own; 0				
AVEH2 1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
INCM Income level (monthly, in euros) INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)					
INCH Income level (hourly, in euros)	1 if the age of the vehicle is 2 years or less; 0 otherwise				
· · · · /	Income level (monthly, in euros)				
AT1 Access time to the parking space of alternative 1 (FSP)					
Treeses time to the parining space of alternative I (I of)					
AT2 Access time to the parking space of alternative 2 (PSP)					
AT3 Access time to the parking space of alternative 3 (PUP)					
TD1 Access time to the destination from the parking space of a tive 1 (FSP)	lterna-				
TD2 Access time to the destination from the parking space of a tive 2 (PSP)	lterna-				
TD3 Access time to the destination from the parking space of a tive 3 (PUP)	lterna-				
FEE1 Parking fee of alternative 1 (FSP)					
FEE2 Parking fee of alternative 2 (PSP)					
FEE3 Parking fee of alternative 3 (PUP)					
LI 1 if the level of income is low; 0 otherwise					
MI 1 if the level of income is medium; 0 otherwise					
HI 1 if the level of income is high; 0 otherwise					

Table 2: Description of the variables

Variable	Min	Max	Mean	St. Dev.
OBSID	1	1576	788.50	455.10
ID	1	201	101.12	57.90
SCENARIO	1	8	4.50	2.29
CHOICE	1	3	1.89	0.97
GENDER	0	1	0.27	0.44
A20	0	1	0.05	0.22
A2130	0	1	0.25	0.43
A3140	0	1	0.25	0.43
A4150	0	1	0.19	0.39
A5160	0	1	0.15	0.36
A61	0	1	0.07	0.25
RESIDENT	0	1	0.53	0.50
OINT	0	1	0.45	0.50
DINT	0	1	0.84	0.37
ODINT	0	1	0.31	0.46
AVEH3	0	1	0.38	0.48
AVEH2	0	1	0.27	0.45
INCM	300	3000	1172.59	763.86
INCH	1.88	18.75	7.33	4.77
AT1	10	15	12.50	2.50
AT2	10	10	10.00	0
AT3	5	5	5.00	0
TD1	10	15	12.50	2.50
TD2	10	15	12.50	2.50
TD3	10	10	10.00	0
FEE1	0	0	0.00	0
FEE2	0.6	0.8	0.70	0.1
FEE3	0.8	1.5	1.15	0.35
LI	0	1	0.70	0.46
MI	0	1	0.20	0.40
HI	0	1	0.10	0.30

Table 3: Descriptive statistics

References

Ibeas, A., dell'Olio, L., Bordagaray, M. and de D. Ortúzar, J. (2014), 'Modelling parking choices considering user heterogeneity', *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice* **70**, 41 – 49. URL: http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0965856414002341